

Columbia Scholastic Press Association

Columbia University, Mail Code 5711, New York, N.Y. 10027-6902

Literary Art Magazine Critique

edited by
CSPAA Committee on Judging Standards

Name of publication AGAPE Year 2016
School OYSTER BAY HIGH SCHOOL
Address 150 EAST MAIN STREET
City OYSTER BAY State NY Zip 11771

Type of school

- Public school
 Private/parochial school
 Other

Summary

	Maximum scores	Your score	All-Columbian honors
I. Essentials	(200)	<u>194</u>	190 pts & above <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
II. Verbal	(400)	<u>382</u>	380 pts & above <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
III. Visual	(400)	<u>394</u>	380 pts & above <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Total Score	(1,000)	<u>970</u>	

Placing: Gold Medalist (800-1,000 points)
 Silver Medalist (600-799 points)
 Bronze Medalist (599 points and below)

Since 1925 the Columbia Scholastic Press Association has evaluated student magazines in an annual process.

The first CSPA evaluation guide for student magazines appeared in 1943 as *Primer of School Magazine Technique*, prepared by John J. Snowcroft, then-Director of Journalism at Central High School in Paterson, New Jersey. The second venture, *Magazine Fundamentals*, edited by Eve B. Bunnell, also of Central High School, was published in 1952. The third edition of *Magazine Fundamentals*, edited by John W. Cutsinger, Jr. then of Westlake High School, Austin, Texas, added some 20 pages of text and illustrations to what had been a simple scorebook.

For this new Critique, the Association turned to Kathleen Zwiebel at Pennsylvania's Pottsville Area High School, where she advised five publications, including the *Expressions Through Creativity* literary-art magazine. She was honored as the National Journalism Teacher of the Year for 1998 by the Dow Jones Newspaper Fund. The CSPA honored her with its Gold Key in 1996, its Diamond Jubilee Award in 2000 and the Charles R. O'Malley Award for Excellence in Teaching in 2001 and its Joseph M. Murphy Award for Outstanding Service in 2010.

Bruce Watterson, chair of CSPAA's committee on judging standards and practices, who currently teaches courses in

journalism/communication on the college level along with Dave Johnson, a teacher of writing at Yale University and at the MFA writing program at The New School helped with updates to the 2010 revision.

As with all of its Critique series, the Association does not attempt to dictate to schools and colleges just how their publications should be edited, designed or published. The CSPA watches keenly for the best quality work that is done by students and advisers working on these publications, and then adjusts its standards accordingly.

Edmund J. Sullivan
Executive Director
Columbia Scholastic Press Association

How the CSPA Rates Student Magazines

The Columbia Scholastic Press Association (CSPA), a program of Columbia University in the City of New York, was established in 1925 to help improve writing through the medium of student publications.

Located throughout the world, these student newspapers, yearbooks, magazines and digital publications enroll in the Association as members each year. The major service to regular members is an annual written evaluation of each member's issues from the prior school year.

Copies of these publications are mailed to the Association's offices in New York City. From there they are sent, in batches, to qualified faculty advisers for student publications, who constitute the CSPA's Board of Judges. These advisers are located throughout the United States and Canada. The publications they advise have been rated highly in prior year's evaluations. Digital publications are judged online. All critiques are emailed to staffs upon completion and review by the Association.

Each student publication is evaluated by a single adviser-judge. The judges work independently but use common instructions and common judging criteria. These criteria are contained within individual editions of the Association's Critique series. The Critique provides constructive, rigorous and specific criteria that describe the ideal student publication.

Magazine Critique

This edition of Student Magazine Critique is the judging instrument used by the Association to conduct that evaluation. Instructions on how to use this book in evaluating student magazines are on the next page.

Magazines are rated according to the

classification checked on the entry form submitted with the magazine. Classification is determined by the type of magazine (literary, literary-art, general) and type of school (college, senior high school, middle school).

Information provided on the entry form gives the Board of Judges enough background to understand local circumstances that pertain to publishing the magazine.

Each magazine is judged on its own merits without regard to previous standing in the CSPA's annual evaluations. The Board of Judges attempts to provide constructive criticism and suggestions for improvement in the spaces.

Awards and Certificates

All publications entered in the annual critique receive a placing, based on these total numerical scores:

Gold Medalist.....	800-1,000
Silver Medalist.....	600-799
Bronze Medalist.....	599 or below

Gold through Bronze Medalist ratings are final. All publications may be eligible for further awards, known as Gold Crown Awards and Silver Crown Awards, based on a separate contest. Results of Medalist Critique do not have any relationship to Crown Awards.

All-Columbian Honors

Each magazine entered in the annual evaluation is eligible to earn additional All-Columbian Honors for special merit in Essentials, Verbal, or Visual. These Honors are awarded, as part of the initial judging, to

those publications that receive very high point totals in one or more of these three categories, as outlined in this Critique.

The minimum point totals for All-Columbian Honors are determined annually by the CSPA and are subject to change from one year to the next. In recent years, All-Columbian Honors have been given only when the publication has achieved the 95th percentile or higher in one or more of the three categories.

Gold and Silver Crown Awards

From 1982 to 1994, the Association presented Gold Crown Awards to the top one percent of those publications entered in the annual critiques. These awards were in addition to any All-Columbian Honors received and superseded the Medalist awards given on the basis of the numerical score earned.

Silver Crown Awards were added in 1985 to honor the next four percent of the top publications, after Gold Crown Awards.

Beginning with the 1994 evaluations, Crown Awards were judged separately from the annual critique. A student magazine may send a second copy of their publication to be judged independently for the Crown Awards. Critique entries continue to qualify for the Gold through Bronze Medalist distinctions. This process no longer nominates publications for Crown Awards, however. The second copy of the magazine must be submitted for analysis by Crown judges, in addition to the copy of the publication submitted for critique.

Finalists for Crown Awards will be announced by January, and awards will be presented at the annual CSPA Conventions (College and Scholastic) in March

About Student Magazines

Student magazines are primarily defined by the type of content they offer to their readers. Most student magazines fall into one of three categories: literary, literary-art or general interest magazines.

Literary magazines offer traditional forms of fiction (short stories) and poetry with an occasional essay. The oldest form of student magazines, they date back at least to the first half of the nineteenth century. As a rule they do not include much, if any, visual content, such as photography. As technology has made the reproduction of visual content easier and less expensive, most student magazines have migrated to the literary-art category.

Literary-art publications add the visual components of art and photography to the literary magazine's verbal content. Today's magazines may also include color, fancy paper, and evidence of the latest in desktop publishing techniques. But many quality literary-art magazines still publish with simple formats using black ink on white paper. It's the content that counts.

General magazines may include feature magazines, folk magazines, and specialty magazines. Feature magazines may include college students' efforts to publish a magazine showcasing their work to an urban campus or a citywide audience. Some examples of specialty magazines include student magazines published as supplements to student newspapers, provided they are designed and printed in a magazine format. Others include magazines with specific "niche" audiences, such as graduate science students at a major research university who are interested in improving their writing skills and presenting scientific research to a more general audience. High school students may publish a serious effort at debating world affairs, modeled after Foreign Affairs.

Some magazines have migrated from print to digital formats with more expected to do so in the near future. Content distinctions largely remain as described above. One advantage of the digital format is that budgets do not limit number of pages as they do with print formats. Digital formats can include more submissions if the staff determines the quality is present. And digital formats can also reach wider audiences than can limited press runs of their print counterparts.

Student Literary Art Magazine Critique

Copyright © 2013 by The Trustees of Columbia University
in the City of New York

For information, write the publisher at:
Columbia Scholastic Press Association
Columbia University
Mail Code 5711
New York, NY 10027

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, except for brief quotation (not to exceed 1,000 words) in a review or professional work without permission in writing from the publisher.

ISBN 978-0-916084-46-9
Manufactured in the United States of America
First Edition August 2003
Second Edition June 2010
Third Edition September 2012

CSPA Critique

Both a Judge's Workbook and Your Scorebook

Because judges use this book for scoring the news publication, erasures and revisions of figures and notations are understandable. In case of obvious mathematical or mechanical errors, ratings will be corrected. Only when released by the CSPA is a rating official. Underlining indicates weaknesses that need attention.

A ✓+ indicates outstanding work; a ✓ indicates very good work that meets the standard; a ✓- indicates work that is below the level of the standard; and an ✗ indicates a real weakness.

I. Essentials

ESSENTIALS refers to the information that makes the literary/art magazine reader-friendly.

Concept	Excellent	Good	Needs work	Missing	Judge's comments and suggestions for improvements.
1. The cover has visual appeal and creates a unique impression of the magazine.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	APPRECIATE the note; it helps to understand the context in which the publication is produced and the staff's reaction to the suggestions in last year's critique.
2. The cover and title page relate visually to each other.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
3. The verbal and visual content work together to create a unified, coherent publication.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
Organization					
4. The front cover includes the name of the magazine, name of the college/school, volume number in Arabic numerals and issue number.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	SORRY to learn of everyone's departure; Agape has always been an excellent lit magazine; was poignant reading "Students put their hearts into their writing this year, making utterly sincere statements about their responses to a complex world."
5. The magazine includes the publication's editorial policy and mission statement.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
6. The editorial policy explains how the staff functions and whether the magazine is an extracurricular activity, part of the curriculum or a juried publication.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	COVER: intriguing photo art and use of white rule on front and black rule on back; definitely arouses reader's curiosity
7. The editorial policy explains how the verbal and visual content is solicited and selected. It includes policies for editing submissions/art.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
8. The mission statement includes a description of the philosophy of the magazine and its purpose.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	TITLE PAGE: photo is dramatic and intriguing; would reduce the type point size one point, change the rule to .5 pt, shift that data to the bottom and let the art dominate the page; the art is amazing, need to feature it more prominently; preferable spelling of adviser is ER
9. The following information is included in the magazine on the title page, staff box or colophon: name of college/school, complete address, date published, volume number (in Arabic numerals), issue number, phone and fax numbers, email address, school population (broken down by student enrollment and school staff) and web site address, if applicable.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
10. There is a complete staff listing that includes staff names, positions/responsibilities and adviser's name.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	

	Excellent	Good	Needs work	Missing	Judge's comments and suggestions for improvements.
11. The colophon/staff box includes publishing specifications, including font families used, computer hardware and software, paper stock and price of the magazine. If there is a theme, the colophon explains how it was chosen.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	EDITORS' MESSAGE: excellent statement of purpose
12. The table of contents listing is accurate and visually/verbally goes with the concept/look of the magazine.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	TABLE OF CONTENTS: nice work in integrating the art; for prose need to indicate genre, fiction, non-fiction, creative non-fiction; you do have essay separated out
13. The table of contents includes titles of all literary and visual content, page numbers where each is located and names of artists and writers. It is organized by genre, i.e., poetry, fiction, non-fiction, photography, artwork.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	FOLIOS: subtle, like the inclusion of the small art
14. Artists and writers title their works.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	p. 40 policies/colophon info excellent
Reader Services					
15. The writer/artist/photographer of each selection has been properly credited and photos/photo illustrations are clearly designated.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	WE are combining the comments for essentials, verbal and visual and doing a narrative by specific pages; this is the best way to approach critiquing a publication and to present feedback in a logical format
16. Folios appear on at least one page of each spread.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
17. Each verbal and visual work includes the writer(s)/artist(s)/designer(s)' name(s) in a distinctive format adjacent to the work. For visual works, the media used is specified; i.e., digital photography, pastel, mixed media, scratchboard, paint, etc.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	pp. 4-5: love the photo, such an expression of pure joy; the lines of the outstretched arms repeat the lines of the tree branches
18. Spread designers are credited on the spread or in the colophon.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
19. Any content (photos, art, infographics) taken from the internet or other sources are properly credited. Permission to reproduce has been obtained and is indicated in the credit by "Reproduced by permission of _____"	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	ANATOMY OF ART: OUTSTANDING, a topic any creative person can relate to because at some point they have lost themselves in their art; avoid beginning headlines with an article, it diminishes the power of the words
20. The magazine includes a description of the distribution process, number of copies printed and scholastic/collegiate press affiliations.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	

SECTION POINTS—Reference (200)

All-Columbian ☑ (190 pts & above)

YOUR SCORE 194

II. Verbal

Verbal elements include all prose fiction and non-fiction in varied story formats, and poetry. All verbal work is in the voice of the student writer.

General

	Excellent	Good	Needs work	Missing	Judge's comments and suggestions for improvements.
1. All stories begin with an impact lead/opening that arouses curiosity.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
2. Leads/openings vary so that no pattern is established.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	pp. 6-7: wonderful perspective and use of light and shadows in the image; poem conveys emotion, has sensory word choice
3. Paragraphs are brief, featuring transitions that lead the reader smoothly through the work.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
4. Transitions avoid repeating what is contained in a quote unless used for emphasis.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	pp. 8-9: amazing detail in the art; powerful personal essay; need to also indicate the genre under the title
5. A new paragraph begins after each quote.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
6. Run-on sentences or sentence fragments do not appear in any story except in dialogue or to convey a special tone.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	pp. 10-11: again, amazing arts, the eyes in the photograph and in the digital image; shift the Starstruck piece down to avoid trapping white space and consider doing as two columns; excellent piece, just be careful not to overuse I
7. Writers avoid redundancies such as using "I" repeatedly.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
8. Subjects and verbs agree; pronouns and antecedents agrees.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
9. The vocabulary is precise and fresh.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
10. The descriptions evoke all five senses and include visual imagery.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	pp. 12-13: instead of stopping the essay by placing the image in the middle, consider moving it to the upper right corner of the page and wrapping the text on its left side; the photo placement p. 13 is fine;
11. The themes are evident to the reader and are clearly developed.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
12. The punctuation, word usage, capitalization and spelling are correct.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
13. The staff uses apostrophes correctly for contractions and possession.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	URBAN TRIBES - consider doing in two or three columns to be more reader friendly; perfect ending
14. The titles, whether connotative or denotative, capture the tone, mood and purpose of the story/poem.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
15. All verbal content has been meticulously proofread.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	

Prose

Prose includes fiction or non-fiction. Fiction often includes short stories, and occasionally a play or novela. Non-fiction may include articles, interviews or essays.

Magazines may freely choose to include or exclude either fiction or non-fiction. In recent years, many student literary or literary-art magazines have emphasized poetry and short stories for verbal content. Some of these magazines have included one or more non-fiction pieces. A few of these magazines have only included non-fiction.

To accommodate this variety, this critique offers several options. Judges may evaluate fiction pieces in the left column below and non-fiction pieces on the right column. Specific judges' comment, appear after the criteria.

Judges will select the criteria they are using to allocate scoring checks.

Evaluates fiction OR non-fiction (this page).

Evaluate BOTH fiction and non-fiction (next page).

	<i>Excellent</i>	<i>Good</i>	<i>Needs work</i>	<i>Missing</i>	
Fiction	OR				Non-Fiction
16. The prose fiction verbal element of the magazine emphasizes telling stories in a compelling, authentic manner. The point of view provides impact and interest.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	21. The prose non-fiction element of the magazine emphasizes telling stories in a compelling, authentic manner. The point of view provides impact and interest.
17. Plots are logical with character conflicts resolved believably.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	22. The non-fiction writing communicates accurate, credible information about things, events, people, concepts and theories.
18. Characters are fully developed with descriptive details so the reader has a visual image of each character.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	23. Non-fiction techniques such as angles, leads, research and interviewing are effective.
19. The protagonists and antagonists are believable.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	24. Craft elements such as description, structure, character and voice are effective.
20. Any literary devices used, such as exposition, alliteration, allegory, irony, satire, parody, personification, imagery, metaphor, simile, flashback, foreshadowing, point of view, etc., serve an obvious purpose.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	25. Non-fiction shows rather than tells. Foreshadowing, timing and character development build the story.

Judge's comments and suggestions for improvements.

Prose

This criteria is to be used for art/literary magazines that produce both Fiction and Non-Fiction.

Fiction

16. The prose fiction verbal element of the magazine emphasizes telling stories in a compelling, authentic manner. The point of view provides impact and interest.

Excellent	Good	Needs work	Missing
✓+	✓	✓-	✗

17. Plots are logical with character conflicts resolved believably.

✓+	✓	✓-	✗
----	---	----	---

18. Characters are fully developed with descriptive details so the reader has a visual image of each character.

✓+	✓	✓-	✗
----	---	----	---

19. The protagonists and antagonists are believable.

✓+	✓	✓-	✗
----	---	----	---

20. Any literary devices used, such as exposition, alliteration, allegory, irony, satire, parody, personification, imagery, metaphor, simile, flashback, foreshadowing, point of view, etc., serve an obvious purpose.

✓+	✓	✓-	✗
----	---	----	---

Non-Fiction

21. The prose non-fiction element of the magazine emphasizes telling stories in a compelling, authentic manner. The point of view provides impact and interest.

✓+	✓	✓-	✗
----	---	----	---

22. The non-fiction writing communicates accurate, credible information about things, events, people, concepts and theories.

✓+	✓	✓-	✗
----	---	----	---

23. Non-fiction techniques such as angles, leads, research and interviewing are effective.

✓+	✓	✓-	✗
----	---	----	---

24. Craft elements such as description, structure, character and voice are effective.

✓+	✓	✓-	✗
----	---	----	---

25. Non-fiction shows rather than tells. Foreshadowing, timing and character development build the story.

✓+	✓	✓-	✗
----	---	----	---

Judge's comments and suggestions for improvements.

pp. 14-15: art is stunning but a little pixelated, could be a broken link or a small photo was enlarged too much;

EDITORIAL - just beautiful, poignant and so true for many writers

pp. 16-17 art perfectly complements the verbal content; what a wonderful tribute to a sister

pp. 20-21 so creative

Verbal Poetry

26. The poetry shows original thinking, fresh insight and varied forms.

✓+

✓

✓-

✗

27. The poetry lifts the reader out of the ordinary.

✓+

✓

✓-

✗

28. Every single word counts, with word choice that is precise and sensory.

✓+

✓

✓-

✗

29. The vocabulary is vivid and sensory.

✓+

✓

✓-

✗

30. Themes are evident and clearly developed. Trite, “teenage angst” themes are avoided.

✓+

✓

✓-

✗

31. Any literary devices used, such as personification, metaphor and simile, create fresh visual imagery.

✓+

✓

✓-

✗

32. There is a “poetry of music” — alliteration, repetition, internal, but not necessarily end of the line rhyme.

✓+

✓

✓-

✗

33. The poems convey ideas with a minimum of words.

✓+

✓

✓-

✗

34. The use of ambiguity, symbolism, irony, and other stylistic elements of poetic diction create poetry that is open to multiple interpretations.

✓+

✓

✓-

✗

35. The reader feels an identification with the poetry.

✓+

✓

✓-

✗

36. Poems use lines and stanzas, not sentences and paragraphs.

✓+

✓

✓-

✗

37. There is a pattern of recurrences of ideas.

✓+

✓

✓-

✗

38. There is parallel phrasing with effective line breaks.

✓+

✓

✓-

✗

39. There is evidence of a broad spectrum of styles and influences in the poetry.

✓+

✓

✓-

✗

40. Specific styles may include free verse, blank verse, Haiku, rhyming couplet and quatrain, sonnet, limerick, villanelle, exquisite corpse poems, six word stories etc.

✓+

✓

✓-

✗

SECTION POINTS— Verbal (400)

All-Columbian ☒ (380 pts & above)

YOUR SCORE 382

Excellent
Good
Needs work
Missing

Judge’s comments and suggestions for improvements.

pp. 22-23: Flower Child is amazing, the detail, the eyes, mesmerizing

ALTERNATIVES: interesting topic, be careful not to over use I; art complements

pp. 24-25 the shading and shadowing in the art so well done

PRESENT TENSE: thought provoking

pp. 26-27: like the blowing kisses point of view; THE BUG: wonderful tribute to the theatrical experience and Bug is the ideal title; the emotion and wanting is captured in the words.

pp. 28-29: BRANDMA definitely makes an impression; SENILE: so poignant, so true

pp. 30-31: ROOTS WITHHOLDING ME - needs more paragraphing, avoid overusing I; but vividly conveys the message

III. Visual

Visual content, design and typography complement each other to present a visually attractive magazine.

Content	Excellent	Good	Needs work	Missing	Judge's comments and suggestions for improvements.
1. All images serve an editorial purpose.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	<p>pp. 32-33: excellent art; STAGNANT MORNING: slanted copy used effectively here as it was on several pieces, excellent design and using typography as art; writing beautiful sentiment</p> <p>pp. 34-35: love the man's expression in the photo</p> <p>ME AND THE MICROSOFT BOX: outstanding; reminds me of the quote one of my former journalism students said in explaining her passion for writing, "All of my heart ends up in ink." What a perfect description for a true journalist and for you.</p> <p>pp. 36-37: ENJOY THE VIEW - emotional, powerful, reflective; art conveys a sense of loneliness</p> <p>pp. 38-39: funny procrastination art; SUFFOCATION - excellent and like the diminishing copy effect by changing point size</p> <p>THE REVOLUTION: unusual topic, excellent historical reference piece</p>
2. All images communicate with the reader.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
3. All images are presented so as to create a strong visual impact on the reader.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
4. The images show evidence of adherence to the composition requirements of dominance, balance, variety and flow.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
5. The leading line or curve brings the reader's eye straight to the center of interest ensuring the greatest visual impact.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
6. The visual themes in the images are fresh, not imitative or trite.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
7. The visual images supplement and work in concert with the verbal content.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
8. The action of the image leads onto, not off, the page.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
9. The pattern or repetition of key elements brings the reader's eye straight to the center of interest.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
10. Every image is strong enough to stand on its own.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
11. Staff uses a variety of media.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
12. The images are conceptually interesting, offering unique angles, fresh viewpoints and provocative insights.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
13. The images exhibit technical merit and creativity.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
14. Images that cross the gutter do not split faces or key elements of an image.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
15. The pages display a visual-verbal connection, visually showing it in images and verbally reinforcing it in copy.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	

	Excellent	Good	Needs work	Missing
16. Each visual element on the page connects to the others, always conceptually, sometimes physically.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗
17. Proper resolution for digital images prevents pixilation.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗
18. The images work on more than one level with composition, angle, distance and point of view all contributing to the overall effect.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗
19. Color, including black and white, helps deliver a message, rather than detracting from it.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗
20. Photographs use several techniques, such as rule of thirds, depth of field, leading lines, framing, patterns, panning, depth of field, backlighting and silhouettes, to draw the reader's attention.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗
Design				
21. The cover creates a unique impression through the use of typography, color and graphics, and introduces the concept/look of the magazine.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗
22. A specific grid/modular plan is used in the design.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗
23. In fiction and non-fiction the story is split into columns. The copy never runs across the page in one column.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗
24. A dominant visual element appears on each spread. Other elements/photographs/art contrast in size and shape; placement varies to avoid visual monotony.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗
25. Every spread has at least three points of entry for the reader.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗
26. Adequate and consistent framing margins have been maintained for the entire magazine.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗
27. The design has focus. Readers know where to look first.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗
28. The design has flow. The reader's eye flows naturally around the spread.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗

Judge's comments and suggestions for improvements.

GENERAL COMMENTS

1. you keep paragraphs brief in prose, EXCELLENT
2. avoid repeating I too many times, it distracts from the message of the piece
3. external margins properly frame the content, EXCELLENT
4. AVOID PLACING art so the reader has to jump it to complete the story
5. try some two and three column designs for prose
6. wonderful, thematic titles for all content, EXCELLENT
7. slant effect on poetry works, adds visual appeal

	Excellent	Good	Needs work	Missing	Judge's comments and suggestions for improvements.
29. Grouped elements have a clear visual relationship. Unrelated elements are separate.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	<p>IF Agape continues, CONSIDER featuring work from the portfolios of AP Studio Art students</p> <p>DO an interview feature with a student artist and an artist from the community, could be someone who works with pottery or jewelry as well</p> <p>ASK each artist/ writer to describe in one sentence their inspiration for their work</p> <p>COULD showcase a complete portfolio of an outstanding artist</p>
30. Each page has been linked to its facing page by one or more of the following: eyelines, photos/art across the gutter, graphics.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
31. Color, including black and white, is used effectively to make an image or verbal content stand out, to evoke emotion, to communicate.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
32. Color, including black and white, is used to group related elements or to enhance the design.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
33. All color has a purpose in the design, and its use is planned and consistent.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
34. Graphics help to develop the “look” of the magazine. They are purposeful and used to unify and separate content.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
35. Graphics enhance, not distract, from the content. They do not interfere with readability of content. Staff avoids the overuse of gimmicks.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
36. The repetition of graphic elements is used effectively throughout the magazine.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
37. The font family for the magazine is repeated in the verbal content, titles, table of contents, colophon, folios and folio tabs.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
38. The font family is easy to read. There is consistency in spacing and type selection in titles, headlines and credits.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
39. Any overprinted or reversed verbal content is easily readable, since overprints appear only on solid, light backgrounds and reverses only on solid, dark backgrounds.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	
40. Long stories are broken up with meaningful subheads, pulled quotes or art.	✓+	✓	✓-	✗	

SECTION POINTS— Visual (400)

All-Columbian ☒ (380 pts & above)

YOUR SCORE 394

Judge's summary comments

A good story/poem is one which celebrates language, takes the reader on a short journey and touches the heart or mind or the imagination. The work in your magazine succeeds in doing that.

Thomas Merton said that art enables us to find ourselves and lose ourselves at the same time. Many of the visual works on the pages of Agape do just that.

Your magazine is outstanding; each page holds one's attention with its visual appeal (and the magazine proves that four color is not needed to build visual appeal). The writing is so good; I found myself going from piece to piece, smiling at some, emotional at others, and finding relatable concepts and experiences in so many.

Congratulations on your Gold Medalist and All Columbian honors.

Columbia Scholastic Press Association

Columbia University, Mail Code 5711, New York, NY 10027-6902